TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

AGAINST TENDER ENQUIRY # PROC-SERVICES/CB/F&A-4311/2019

FOR HIRING OF SERVICES FOR PHYSICAL VERIFICATION AND RECONCILLATION OF FIXED ASSETS

Sr.#	Bidder's Name	Technically Responsive (Yes/No.)	Reasons for Rejection
1.	M/s Deloitte Yousaf Adil Chartered Accountants, Islamabad	Yes	-
2.	M/s A.F. Ferguson & Co., Chartered Accountants, Islamabad	Yes	-
3.	M/s EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants, Islamabad	No	Bid Bond was not found with Technical Bid, therefore bid was rejected as per clause 23.5 (criteria for summary rejection) of Master set of Tender document for services.



Technical Evaluation Report Tender No. PROC-SERVICES/CB/F&A-14311/2019 Physical Verification & Reconciliation of Fixed Assets

S. No.	Bidder Name	Technically Responsive (Yes/ No)	Reasons for Rejection
1	M/s Deloitte Yousaf Adil	YES	
2	M/s A.F Ferguson & Company	YES	

Ihtisham Khan Materials Officer Ext: 2158 Muhammad Ibrar Sr.Accountant Ext: 2540 Sohail Zafar Sethi Dy. Chief Accountant Ext: 4073 Asif Kamal
Chief Accountant (S&FA)
Ext: 3160



TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

AGAINST TENDER ENQUIRY # PROC-SERVICES/CB/F&A/4311/2019

FOR HIRING OF SERVICES TO CARRYOUT 100% PHYSICAL VERIFICATION AND RECONCILIATION OF FIXED ASSETS

				1	_2
S.No	Items	Marks	Criteria	AFF Ferguson	Deloitte Yousif Adil Saleem
1	Year of establishment. Total experience in years of firm	15	15 years and above 15 marks less than 15 years will get prorated marks		15
2	Affiliation with International Audit firms	5	International Affiliation will carry 5 marks	5	5
3	No. of offices in Pakistan	10	Each office will get 2 marks	6	8
4	No. of partners and Managers	20	Following marks will be given. Maximum marks will be 20. FCA/ACA 2 marks each	20	20
	Assignment of physical verification & reconciliation of fixed assets completed during last ten (10) years	30	Each similar assignment with a value of: 1. Rs. Up to Rs1 billion zero marks. 2.Rs. More than Rs 1 billion and upto Rs 5 billion 5 marks. 3.More than Rs.5 billion 10 marks. Maximum marks will not be exceed 30.	25	30
6	Rating of quality Assurance by ICAP	5	5 marks for satisfactory Rating during last 5 years (1 mark for each year)	5	5
7(i)	Physical verification & reconciliation of fixed assets conducted during last 15 years :(i) E&P/Oil & Gas Company.	6	(i) 3 marks of each assignment up to 6 marks	0	0
7(ii)	(ii) Other Company/Organization	9	(ii) 3 marks of each assignment up to 9 marks.	_ 9	9
	Total	100		85	92

Intisham Khan

Materials Officer (MT & C)

Extn: 2158

Sohail Zafar 3ethi DCA (S & FA) Extn: 4073

Muhammad Íbrar Sr. Accountant (S&FA) Extn: 2540

ASIF KAMAL CA (S&FA) Ext: 3160

TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT AGAINST TENDER ENQUIRY # PROC-SERVICES/CB/F&A/4311/2019

FOR HIRING OF SERVICES TO CARRYOUT 100% PHYSICAL VERIFICATION AND RECONCILIATION OF FIXED ASSETS

Deloitte

S.No	Items	Marks	Criteria	Required document	Status	Document reference	Deloitte
	Year of establishment. Total experience in years		15 years and above 15 marks less than 15 years will				
	of firm	15	get prorated marks	ICAP letter	Available	1972	15
	Affiliation with International Audit firms		International Affiliation will carry 5 marks	License agreement with			
		5				i	
2				International Firm	Available	Deloite Touche Tohmatsu	5
	No. of offices in Pakistan	10	Each office will get 2 marks			1.Karachi 2.Lahore 3.Multan	
3				ICAP	Available	4.Islamabad	8
	No. of partners and Managers	20	Following marks will be given. Maximum marks will			1	
4			be 20. FCA/ACA 2 marks each	ICAP	Available	More than ten	20
	Assignment of physical verification &		Each similar assignment with a value of: 1. Rs. Up to			1.NHA Rs 3,633 Billion 2.ICI	
			Rs1 billion zero marks. 2.Rs. More than Rs 1 billion			1	
	reconciliation of fixed assets completed during	30	and upto Rs 5 billion 5 marks. 3. More than Rs.5	Assignment completion		Pakistan Rs 10.5 Billion 3.Glaxo	
		(billion 10 marks. Maximum marks will not be exceed	certificate/ agreement	ļ	1	
_	1	ĺ		from client with value of			
	last ten (10) years		30.	Fixed Assets	Available	Smith Rs 8.31 Billion	30
_	Rating of quality Assurance by ICAP	5	5 marks for satisfactory Rating during last 5 years (1	ICAN I	0	1	5
	Physical verification & reconciliation of fixed	<u> </u>	mark for each year) (i) 3 marks of each assignment up to 6 marks	ICAP letter	Available	 	5
	Physical vertication of reconciliation of fixed		(1) 5 marks of each assignment up to 6 marks		1		
l	assets conducted during last 15 years :(i) E&P/Oil	6		 Assignment completion	1	1	
	assets conducted during last 15 years .(i) car / On	"		certificate/ agreement		1	
7(i)	& Gas Company.			from client.	Nil		0
<u> </u>	(ii) Other Company/Organization		(ii) 3 marks of each assignment up to 9 marks.			1.NHA Rs 3,633 Billion 2.ICI	
		9	_ '	Assignment completion		Pakistan Rs 10.5 Billion 3.Glaxo	
700				certificate/ agreement from client.	S. oileble	Smith Rs 8.31 Billion	
7(ii)	Total	100		inom chent.	Available	Jamen KS 8.31 Billion	9 92
	TOTAL	100	<u> </u>	1	<u> 1</u>		92

Materials Officer (MT & C)

Extn: 2158

Sohail Zafar Gethi DCA (S & FA) Extn: 4073

Muhammad Ibrar Sr. Accountant (S&FA) Extn: 2540

ASIF KAMAL CA (S&FA) Ext: 3160

TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT AGAINST TENDER ENQUIRY # PROC-SERVICES/CB/F&A/4311/2019 FOR HIRING OF SERVICES TO CARRYOUT 100% PHYSICAL VERIFICATION AND RECONCILIATION OF FIXED ASSETS

A.F. Ferguson & Co.

	A.F. Ferguson & Co.			T			A.F.Ferguson &
S.No	Items	Marks	Criteria	Required document	Status	Document reference	Co.
	Year of establishment. Total experience in years	15	15 years and above 15 marks less than 15 years will				
	of firm		8	ICAP letter	Available	1948	15
'	Affiliation with International Audit firms		International Affiliation will carry 5 marks	License agreement with			
1		5					
		_					
2				International Firm	Available	pwc-1-7-2000	5
Į.	No. of offices in Pakistan		Each office will get 2 marks			1.Karachi 2.Lahore 3.Islamabad	
		10					
3				ICAP	Available	<u></u>	6
	No. of partners and Managers		Following marks will be given. Maximum marks will				
		20					·
4			be 20. FCA/ACA 2 marks each	ICAP	Available	More than ten	20
	Assignment of physical verification &		Each similar assignment with a value of: 1. Rs. Up to			1.Maple Leaf Rs 40.6 Billion	
			Rs1 billion zero marks. 2.Rs. More than Rs 1 billion				
	reconciliation of fixed assets completed during	30	and upto Rs 5 billion 5 marks. 3.More than Rs.5	Assignment completion		2.Overseas Rs 1.2 Billion 3.Sea	
	recommended of the desired completed during	30	•	certificate/ agreement		2.0verseus no 112 omion 3.0eu	
			billion 10 marks. Maximum marks will not be exceed	from client with value of			
5	last ten (10) years		30.	Fixed Assets	Available	and land Rs 5.9 Billion	25
	Rating of quality Assurance by ICAP		5 marks for satisfactory Rating during last 5 years (1				
6		١١	mark for each year)	ICAP letter	 Available		5
	Physical verification & reconciliation of fixed		(i) 3 marks of each assignment up to 6 marks		Available		
	'		i	Assignment completion			
1	assets conducted during last 15 years :(i) E&P/Oil	6		certificate/ agreement			
7(i)_	& Gas Company.			from client.	Nil	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	0
1	(ii) Other Company/Organization	Ì,	(ii) 3 marks of each assignment up to 9 marks.	Assignment completion]	1.Maple Leaf Rs 40.6 Billion	
70.03		9		certificate/ agreement from client.	Available	2.Overseas Rs 1.2 Billion 3.Sea	
7(ii)	Total			irom caent.	Available	and land Rs 5.9 Billion	9
	Total	100	1		L		85

Ihtisham Khan
Materials Officer (MT & C)

Extn: 2158

Sohail Zafar Sethi DCA (S & FA) Extn: 4073

11/6/19 Muhammad ibrar Sr. Accountant (S&FA) Extn: 2540

ASIF KAMAL CA (S&FA) Ext: 3160